

## 28th ifva Animation Category Jury Meeting Transcript

Jury Members : Lo Che Ying (Lo) , Max Hattler (Max), Haze Tsui (Tsui), Koji Yamamura (Koji), Joycelyn Choi (Choi)

Organizer representative: Kattie Fan (Fan), Sandy Lai, Anson Yip, Vanessa Ying

---

Fan: Today's mission is to choose the prizes. We have three prizes. The first one is the Gold and the second one is Silver, the third one is a Special Mention. You can see on the screen the cash prizes and awards for the various awards. For your information, we have a total five categories and we received almost 1000 submissions ranging from short films, animations and also media arts. For the Animation category, we received submissions from both Hong Kong and other Asian cities. So altogether we have 116 eligible applications for this year and we have the first-round jury panel who selected ten finalists and today we have nine. Max is also one of the jurors for the finalist panel. In case you have any questions about why we have chosen these finalist, Max can give some remarks on that. First of all, I would suggest we can go through all the finalists works one by one as warm up, and also to give some comments and on each film. The second part will be to nominate which works to receive awards.

Max: A question about the MacBook Prize. Is that a separate prize or will it go to whoever gets the gold award or silver award?

Fan: It depends, because the MacBook Pro, we will only be given to the local award winner. We will give it to the top local winner. So for example, if the Hong Kong animator gets the Silver Award, then she or he will also be entitled to have this.

Lo: So only for local works.

Fan: Yes, for some shipping and a lot of logistic reasons, and also an additional support to locals.

Max: For example, if the gold and silver award would go to a non-Hong Kong filmmaker...

Fan: Then that would be the Special Mention. Or, for example, but we haven't tried that before, in case Gold and Silver and Special Mention all go to Asian

entries and no Hong Kong entries get awards, then we have to choose one. But we haven't yet experienced something like that before, so let's see. Any other questions? If that's okay, we can go through the works one by one. The first film will be *The Square City*.

Koji: The graphic style is good. But I think the Mahjong and the city metaphor doesn't work very well. It's just not fresh and is not an easy metaphor.

Tsui: I can say I understand the script and I understand the voiceover, but it is not doing the best voice acting, and it doesn't help the work about its message. Actually, I can't follow the storyline, it's just the kid wandering around and looking at something and maybe dreaming. And I don't think it's successful in delivering a clear message.

Max: I liked it. For me, it worked well. But then I don't speak Cantonese, so I have a different angle to it. I was in the pre-selection, and this was one of the strongest films, and that's why it's in here. It worked very well for me in the in the cinema, better than watching it on the small screen.

Lo: I think the theme is well delivered, actually. It talks about the pressure from most adults to their children, what they expect the children to be when they grow up. Especially in Hong Kong, many small children are under this kind of pressures, and this film is interesting because it mixes in gambling, which is very popular in Hong Kong. People like horse racing, lucky draw, mahjong, everything. Adults love this. These kinds of things have some influence on younger children because they don't know what gambling is, they watch the parents or adults play this kind of thing. There should be some influence on them. This work uses a lot of dialogue and make it into some kind of melodrama. But actually, it really doesn't work much on the whole. The illustration is interesting. I appreciate that this film is very Hong Kong, most elements are Hong Kong, and that's the point.

Choi: It's very Hong Kong because the square city or Mahjong is not just a game, but it is also very competitive. So it is some kind of a reflection of Hong Kong, the city and the children who are facing a very competitive environment. The square city is a metaphor because they are trapped inside the square city. I actually I quite like it. But I do understand that the metaphor may not be completely well played out. It could be better, I suppose. But personally, I find it very local, very Hong Kong. I like the idea. I find it quite interesting.

Fan: Anything to add? If not, we can move on to the next one, *MUI*.

- Koji: I like this unique graphic style, it is using a different of form and mix one frame. I like the experimental development, it is very interesting and the sound is not dialogue. It's a kind of poem. It sounds like a lovely style. I couldn't get the story and what they want to say, but I like the film style.
- Lo: This year we have some very personal films. I think this film is one of them, very personal because it talks about the relationship between grandson and grandmother. *My dear son* is very personal. *Lost in Waltz* is also personal. *MUI* is quite interesting because the just like Koji said it is a different kind of mixture of images in one scene. It looks complicated, but it is well-designed. The use of sketch-like drawings and computer-generated models, which is very full of textures and very interesting. For the soundtrack, because it should be recorded from real conversation, from the director and his grandmother, so it's very lively and real. But for people who don't understand Cantonese like Koji or Max, it will lose something. You can only read the captions, and the presentation will be lost a little bit. I love this piece too because it's quite annoying, but annoying is the point that the director wants us to feel because he is facing an old person who can't calculate and everything. The communication is very difficult but still because they linger together because they're family, so the contrast between them is well presented in this work. I love this one.
- Max: This was one of my favorites in the pre-selection. I think it really stood out. It's in a very experimental style, but at the same time, using Cantonese and has a local feel and this very “annoying” aesthetics. I found it quite anarchic, in a good way, quite punk. Watching it now in the cinema, it worked a little bit less well for me than when I was watching it on the small screen at home on the TV. I think the sound isn't mixed too well, like it doesn't quite carry.
- Choi: I like this work a lot as well. I think it's quite artistic. I find the grandmother quite endearing, not to the point of annoying for me. She keeps messing up with the numbers and the animators have the number written on the screen. I quite like that approach. As Max said, it's quite punk and interesting, it's not boring. I would much prefer this one than the *Waltz*. I think it's more dynamic and has more energy in it.
- Tsui: I didn't focus on the dialogue because it's just repeatedly messing up with the sums. The thing moving forward is the relationship between the grandson and the grandmother, because I can understand the patience from teaching a nonsense grandparent about how to count numbers. It's just like a journey, and I enjoyed it a lot.

- Fan: Let's get back to *Uncle Babysitter 2*.
- Koji: I enjoy it because it's very comical. I don't know why, but it's only a man's world, and the baby. I don't know why, but there's no women. Every character is a man. That's the point. I am very interested in this film and I laughed a lot. But it's not sophisticated. It only has gags.
- Choi: I think it's very enjoyable to watch, but compared to others, it doesn't have the depth. It's a crazy, carefree joy ride, and that's it for me. I enjoy it, but it won't be my first choice for the award, to be honest.
- Tsui: I quite agree with Joycelyn (Choi), but it's already the sixth time I have watched this one. I still laughed.
- Lo: It's really entertaining and technical wise, it's a very good demonstration of Japanese comic style. The limited animation use in the film works a lot. Of course, it's crazy and nonsensical. But still, you laugh.
- Tsui: It's more a commercial rather than artistic piece.
- Lo: I think that's the purpose of the film because it just wants to make you laugh.
- Tsui: And as a background, this is *Uncle Babysister 2* because this is the second episode.
- Lo: The first one is also interesting but two is more crazy.
- Max: In the pre-selection we decided to include it for a variety of reasons and because it gives laughs. It's funny and I agree it's a bit commercial and it's a bit on the nose. But it's very well crafted. That's not easy at all. I think it's a very well-made film.
- Lo: Yeah, especially for that kind of animation., the timing and the rhythm of the action has to be really nice, otherwise you won't laugh. We move to the fourth one, *My Dear Son*.
- Koji: I like the collage techniques, the characters are interesting, and it's very complete and well done. It depicts the social appearance and the realisation of one's true nature through the conflict between parents and children. The subject is very interesting. The story works with the collage style. It's like a mask and they move their faces that they found each other in the nature. I

like this one.

Lo: The use of collage is really nice for this one although collage is an old style of animation technique. The topic says that human beings are all collage of fragments from our memories, from our family, personal culture and society, so we are all collage of other things, so I think the use of collage is really nice. When we talk about the raising of young children, adults usually want to mold their children just like them. But actually, this is not a good way of education or raising children. This topic is quite universal, so it's good to talk about it. There are many symbolic elements in the whole film and the sound design and transition are good. It opens like some kind of suspense animation, but it turns out to be about the relationship between the mother and the children. The ending is really nice because finally the mother finds out you have to adapt and do something for the children, not like other people in the city. It's a very complicated work. I really love this one.

Max: I like it. I don't have many comments. I like this film. It's maybe not my favorite. It's a good film.

Lo: It's very well executed.

Choi: I think it's well made. The collage is nice and the story itself is solid, but it's not very fresh for me.

Tsui: Maybe it's too personal. It got my emotion, but it's maybe too personal. I still like the twist at the end because the mother is also a cat, but I already knew that before.

Fan: Let's move on to the next one, *Lost in a Waltz*.

Koji: A record of the memory of her mother. I like drawing style. But I could not find any more beyond the theme of comparing memories. The story does not work a lot. I just like the drawing style.

Lo: I think it's beautiful. The music is good. Everything is beautiful, and that's it. After watching the film, I really don't know what her mother looks like or more about her mother. I can't get the character or some personal particular characteristics of her mother, only she said this and that. But anyway, it's beautiful.

Tsui: Maybe it's not about storytelling. To me it's just a good music video. The abstract expression is impressive to me.

- Choi: I think that the melody helps because it's a very familiar tone, so it's very easy to get into the mood. I think it's very smooth. Everything is nice and it is a beautiful film. But my problem is it doesn't move me somehow. And I feel for a subject like that, I should be moved. As Haze (Tsui) said, it may not work as well as I hoped. It's beautiful, but it just doesn't move me.
- Max: I agree. To me, this worked much better on the big screen than on a small screen. It's very melancholic, about remembering things, and it's nicely put together. But once it ends, I don't remember it. It doesn't leave a big impression.
- Fan: Next one is *Patient's Mind*.
- Koji: I like this art form, the very artistic way and frames. The style of subject matter and technique are very interesting. I saw this film several times. The first impression was very strong. But there's no point of arrival. What finally happens with the doctor? Maybe they are the same person, doctor and patient? I couldn't get the subject matter of this director, what he's trying to say. Technically, it is a very experimental way of narrative, which is interesting. Also what makes it interesting is the changing viewpoint. The animation technique is very good.
- Max: This is my favorite. I still don't quite understand it. I've watched it many times because I had to write the juror's comment. So I kept watching it and watching it. You could argue it doesn't work because it's too complicated. But for me, it doesn't matter because it just means I want to watch it again and again. For me personally, that's not a negative. I think it just makes it more mysterious. I really like the style, the painting style, the colors, the different perspectives, the split screen, the soundtrack as well. The whole mystery of it, is this himself? This is my favorite among all the selections.
- Lo: I really love the structure of the film. It can be an installation of five screens of five patterns running at the same time. You can watch it and reconstruct the whole thing in in your mind. It does have this way of viewing. Five screens structure, the artistic way and experimental, everything is well-combined together. The use of color, the green and the red is really nice, especially the green. The green is from China, that kind of China green, you can't find it everywhere. The combination of color and the texture of the painting is really unique and it helps the whole thing. This is a very good work.

Choi: I like the visual style. I think it is very strong and very bold. I probably don't get the story as well, but it doesn't bother me. I think it's very stylish and it feels contemporary.

Tsui: The technical score is high for me, and I agree with what Lo Sir said, maybe it's better for this to be an installation because the audience can pick up what they want to see. The organization and sequence is not a linear story, and I can pick more than five options of the ending, maybe there's a lot more. I was impressed with the thumbnail after the end credits. Before that, I think it's a normal work. It would be better work if it's outside the theatre.

Fan: The next work is *Well Wishes My Love, Your Love*.

Koji: The visual style is very unique, but for me it's a little bit too digital. The storyline is simple and very quiet film. The story is about sharing the sense of others. Its subject is very interesting for me.

Max: This also was one of my favorites. Watching it in the cinema didn't quite work as well as on the small screen. Again, I think it's the sound mix. That didn't bother me on the small screen. I really like the sound. He composed his own soundtrack for this, so for me, that's another strong point. It's very digital, but then the sound is also very digital, so it works. In the cinema, it's not quite as strong as on a smaller screen, but I still like it a lot. I like the visual style, that's what drew me in at first. I also like the storytelling, it's very poetic and sensitive and cute and a bit weird, but also quite clear storytelling with a nice ending. It's touching, very abstract. Sometimes you almost can't see what's happening, but at the same time it still touches you. I liked the little moments of the solar eclipse and the three-legged horse.

Lo: I like the style for particular frames, but the whole film is too digital for me. Sometimes I can't get into something because it's too digital.

Tsui: It's easy to get distracted from the over-detail on the screen. Maybe it's okay for me to watch 3 minutes, but 9 minutes was too much.

Choi: I agree with Lo Sir. The visual style is very attractive, but it also makes it harder to get into the story somehow. The visual style is attractive, but maybe I got lost in the digital world.

Lo: Actually, the story is not that hard to understand.

Max: I've seen it a couple of times, and the first time I was just like, wow, the style.

And then the second time I picked up more of the story. So, if you see it for the first time, there's a danger that you it alienates you so much that you sort of just give up.

Lo: Yeah, I think so, because I only watched it once.

Max: For me, it really jumped out because of the style, it's something that I hadn't seen done in this way. Sometimes I wish he had pushed it even further, like in some of the scenes, he's doing less of that pattern stuff, and I wish he would have kept it really abstract. But I really enjoyed, that mix of using 3D animation, but then having this flat pattern that almost makes it 2D again. I think that's quite fresh.

Lo: Technical-wise, I don't know how he made it, but sometimes I'm quite hesitant about this kind of CG, because the action is real. Sometimes I think maybe it's better to just find some real actors. This is just using some kind of software to transform the images, and I lost interest in the animation. Because it's real, the movements are realistic.

Tsui: Maybe the linkage between the style and the story is not strong enough.

Fan: The next one is *Everywhere*.

Koji: I couldn't get this story. There is something behind there, but I didn't understand the death of the yellow cat in middle of story. It's about self-sacrificing or something, I don't know. But I don't get this. And the style is not so unique. It's a very ordinary cartoon style. For me, I'm not much interested in this film.

Max: For me, it's not independent enough. It's too commercial. It's really well done, and pushes all the right buttons. It's well-animated and the soundtrack carries the story. It's a very strong film.

Lo: It's a promotional commission from the Cancer Society. You see it in the end credit. But it works.

Tsui: Now you know the yellow cat dies of cancer.

Lo: It's a fun film because the purpose for this is for general audience to relieve from some loved one who's died of cancer or something. I think it works. But of course it's using very traditional way of animation style and good music, very dramatic music because it doesn't have a dialogue, so everything is put



together and easy to understand and feel. Of course, it's not anything experimental.

Choi: It's very well made, but it's a little bit commercial, there's no surprise. The character design is not unique enough. I like all the movement and things like that, but it's not independent enough. The character design is a little bit too common.

Tsui: It is my favorite, actually, it got the highest score, technical-wise. It has the best mise-en-scene, cinematography, all that got the highest score. It's really like a commercial because it's a commissioned work for the organization. But it did actually deliver the message and got the emotion of the audience. I'm not sure if it's independent enough or not. Maybe we can discuss afterwards. To me, it's the best film of this selection.

Fan: The last one is *A Guitar in the Bucket*.

Koji: The characters and the storytelling is a very unique, and setting and the story are straight forward and the narrative is interesting. The episodes are a bit scattered for me. It's a little bit long. Maybe the story should be more compact. The storytelling is very unique. I like it.

Lo: The style is interesting. It's a little bit long because it doesn't get to the point, it's got some ideas, but not so exact because even though we follow the main characters, we can't see the changes from her. I just can't get into what she thinks. She always exaggerates and says that she wants to go to the musician city to play guitar. I can feel that, but it's not strong enough for me. There's no particular scene that I can get the impact from. It just shows a world like this. Maybe I should watch it again. Anyway, it's interesting.

Choi: I like this a lot. I think that's the point. The filmmaker is trying to make a social commentary. You think you can go places and make changes, but at the end you're stuck. The character doesn't go through a big change. She throws the two strings of her guitar in exchange of the company the dog. I think it's actually a very sad film. I quite like it. I find the style quite unique and I like this kind of social commentary. It's so dark but you won't see it on the surface. It looks like something light, but actually it's not. If you watch it again, you might be suicidal is when you think about it. Everything you have, in the morning everything is back to zero. It's almost like *Squid Game* and when you want to talk to someone, that person says, I only accompany you to work. If you want to have a conversation with me, you have to pay extra. It's actually it's a very sad story. I quite like it because the contrast of the

simplicity of the character design and the actual message. Today, people may want to change the world, but in the end, nothing can be done.

Max: Yeah, very Korean. There are so many animations coming out of Korea that if you've never been there, you will think this is hell. It's so restrictive and people are so trapped. I like this one.

Tsui: It's interesting to me. And I could laugh when she driving the taxi. I like the taxi scene. The couple goes in the back seat, and the slap and the kiss are funny.

Fan: We can proceed to the nominations. If you like some of them, maybe you are ready to nominate the Gold Award first.

Choi: Is it one film for one award?

Fan: Basically, yes.

Lo: This is a frequently asked question. Every year some people ask it. We have to choose sometimes. Shall we nominate the Gold first or we list out the best three?

Choi: It might be easier if we choose our top three.

Fan: It's okay to choose three or four. At least we can eliminate a little bit, and narrow down the selection.

Tsui: *Everywhere, A Guitar in the Bucket, Lost in Waltz and MUI.*

Lo: *MUI, My Dear Son, and Patient's Mind.*

Choi: *A Guitar in the Bucket, MUI and Patient's Mind.*

Max: *Patient's Mind, MUI, Well Wishes My Love, Your Love and A Guitar in the Bucket.*

Koji: I choose *MUI, My Dear Son, and Patient's Mind.*

Fan: *MUI* has the most votes, but that doesn't mean it's the best. Maybe it's just the most average. Maybe we can begin with *MUI*.

- Koji: *MUI* is not the best one for me. For me, it's Special Mention. It's a very experimental and interesting film. Maybe I give one more vote, *A Guitar in the Bucket*. *Patient's Mind* and *A Guitar in the Bucket* are best or second best for me.
- Max: My favorite is *Patients Mind*. *MUI* is also not my favorite.
- Tsui: I would also nominate *MUI* as special mention.
- Choi: I go for *A Guitar in the Bucket* for Gold, and Special Mention for *MUI*.
- Lo: I really like *My Dear Son* because it is good in many ways. It's easy to watch and you got the message and the whole film is well executed. But it's not that experimental because collage is a very old technique, and the visual is not that impressive compared with *MUI* or *Patients Mind*, and they talk about different things. I really love the storytelling of *My Dear Son* because it doesn't have any dialogue, but it tells us everything in a good way. After watching *MUI*, I really feel the connection between the grandson and grandmother. The soundtrack is really attractive for me. The voice is cute, and old people sometimes talk like this, so it's very warm in a way, especially in Cantonese. But for international audience, I think that something is lost because of the dialogue. It doesn't work well for non-Cantonese speaking audience. But anyway, the whole thing is good because the visuals are very complete. There are different kinds of art forms put together and well-combined. *Patient's Mind* has a very good structure, very complicated way of telling a story. I love it too. For Silver, I vote for *MUI* because it's more familiar to me as an audience. And *Patient's Mind* is a good work, and I would have it as Special Mention.
- Koji: For me, Gold is *My Dear Son*. This film is very complete. The subject and material are solid. It is an experimental film, but it targets people at large, not just animations. *Patient's Mind* is Silver for me, the graphic style is the most unique in this competition. The structure is interesting, but not so new. The graphic style is very strong, but I couldn't find any deeper subject in the storytelling. I watched the film several times but I couldn't find any, so it's just experimental. It's Silver and not the highest prize for me.
- Lo: For me *A Guitar in the Bucket* is too Korean. I've seen several animations from Korea that talk about the same thing but presented in different ways. This is one of them, that's it.
- Tsui: For me *Everywhere* is Gold, and *A Guitar in the Bucket* is Silver.

Lo: *My Dear Son* got the big award in Digicon 6 TBS last year. Most juries love this, not just from Japan, also from other countries. They liked the combination of the technique and the topic. The director chose to put their own experience of raising children into the film. There are also some social incidents, like things that happened in Hong Kong in the last few years. But of course, it's very subtle. It's not a simple film, there are many symbolic things inside the whole thing. Everything is symbolic but not easy to get, maybe because she doesn't want to talk about those topics.

Fan: Joycelyn (Choi) Haze (Tsui) and Max, you must fight for your Gold choice.

Choi: I think *A Guitar in the Bucket* deserves something. I am willing to put my vote into *Patient's Mind* if you can have two Gold winners.

Lo: What's your two Golds?

Choi: Although my personal favourite is *A Guitar in the Bucket*, after listening to Lo's deliberation, I am inclined to accept "My Dear Sons" and "Patient's Mind" - if there are two Golds.

Lo: That means you agree that *My Dear Sons* should get Gold.

Choi: Only if there are two winners. I like *My Dear Son* too, but as this is ifva, we should celebrate something more unique and different. In any case, I want to insist that there should be something for *A Guitar in the Bucket*.

Tsui: What's your choice? Gold for *A Guitar in the Bucket*?

Choi: Originally. But after hearing such persuasive discussion, I would put my vote in *Patient's Mind*.

Lo: So your first Gold nomination is *Patient's Mind*. And if there is a second Gold, it would be *My Dear Son*?

Fan: If we are going to present two Gold awards, I think you have to tell me why.

Choi: It is the balance. They represent diverse animation techniques.

Lo: If we really have two Golds and then we will lose one silver.

Fan: Usually this is this will be the case. If we have two Gold then we won't be

able to have Silver. We will divide the cash prize. It makes a statement too. It means that we have two equally outstanding works. And I must say that it is not too frequent to have two Gold awards because it means that the quality is really high, and the five of you could not come up with one Gold Award. This is the statement we are sending out, so you must be clear about that. Sometimes there will be two Silver awards and the Gold Award will be withheld. That means there's no finalist that deserves to get Gold.

Lo: I think *My Dear Son* deserves Gold.

Max: *My Dear Son* is a cute, sweet film. It works well. Visually, I don't think it's all that interesting. It feels like a lot of this kind of digital After Effects, stuff that I've seen for the last 25 years. I know that there's layers and little social commentary and so on. And that's great, but I don't know if it deserves a Gold. I still would say *Patients Mind* is the Gold because it's just it's really fresh. I can keep watching it. *Guitar in the Bucket* is nice, but I wouldn't defend it strongly. *Well Wishes My Love*, I'm not even going to try because I'm on my own there. *MUI* for me would be a Silver, and *A Guitar in the bucket* is a Special Mention.

Choi: I'm going to change my vote. I will vote for *Patient's Mind* for Gold, Silver for *Guitar in the Bucket*.

Lo: How about Gold for *Patient's Mind*, Silver for *My Dear Son*, *MUI* for Special Mention?

Fan: Let's wait for Haze (Tsui) to say something first. You can fight for *Everywhere*.

Tsui: Maybe the discussion is about commercial work, or commission work versus artistic work, because I believe that the directors have put their best effort to give their artistic sense and art sense for this work and it is really well. It got the highest score in terms of technical aspect and it actually is touching for some audience with the same experience. I'm not sure if it's meaningless because it's commercial. I do think is representative of Hong Kong of last year. It's quite good for them to do the experiments with the camera movements and of no edit point in between.

Choi: I think it's very well made technically. I was asking Kattie (Fan) about the judging criteria. In the instruction to jurors it says that independent spirit is the most important assessment criteria in our competition. That's why I didn't vote for it. I think it's very well made.

- Tsui: I tried my best to fight for it.
- Choi: Of course, it is a good discussion. Can a commission work be independent?
- Tsui: Next time, if there is another commission work, do they have a right to apply, or should they just be rejected?
- Fan: Basically, we accept commission work. We don't accept commercials, like TV commercials. With music video, it depends. Nowadays some of these are quite independent and even experimental as well. What we won't accept are TV commercials. For commissioning, there are always some commissioning not only with animations, but it also happens a lot in other categories, like for example the Fresh Wave. You can't say it is commissioning, but they also fight to get commission fees or production fees provided by other organizations. If we eliminate all these works, a large number of films will not be eligible for this competition. Also, even in some relatively commercial production, there's still some independent spirit. When considering independent production, maybe you will refer a lot to the budget or production costs, but independent spirit can mean something inside the work itself.
- Choi: I didn't say it should be ineligible for awards, but because independent spirit is the most important assessment criteria, I just thought other works carry more independent spirit. I'm not saying that this work is not eligible for competing, it's just that it seems other works are more independent, that's all. I think it's a very well made, but if this is the most important assessment criteria, then...That's why I am rooting for *Patient's Mind*.
- Lo: In ifva, "i" stands for independent always in my mind. *Everywhere* is a very well-done animation work in different ways and of course it's unique in its storytelling because you can say is some new way of telling stories. It is not very cliché or traditional. There is something new, something interesting they want to try. The whole thing does have a purpose, which is to promote something, to send a very strong message to the audience. I think this is some kind of barrier for the whole thing, because their main goal is to deliver the story in a very easy watching way. It is quite a success, but I think that we have other choices much better suited to ifva. Even *My Dear Son*, you can say the storytelling is not too special. But still, there is something there, compared with *Everywhere*.
- Tsui: To make things easier, should we lock down *MUI* as the Special Mention

first?

Choi: It might depend on which one gets the Silver award.

Fan: Haze (Tsui), do you have something to say about *Patient's Mind*?

Tsui: Let me pick two works to speak for, *My Dear Son* and *Patient's Mind*. Between these two works, I prefer *Patient's Mind*. It has higher score than *My Dear Son*.

Fan: So we agree that *Patient's Mind* will get the Gold award.

(The jurors agreed.)

Fan: Then, we can talk about Silver. We have three nominations for the Silver, *MUI*, *My Dear Son* and *A Guitar in the Bucket*.

Choi: Can we have two Special Mentions since there's no cash money involved. They only get a certificate anyway.

Lo: That would be easy, I think.

Max: Can I make a suggestion? I think *A Guitar in the Bucket* is going to win prizes everywhere. *MUI*, on the other hand, I don't know.

Lo: *MUI* is from Macau. But they deserve something.

Max: I know it's not a Hong Kong film, but it's in the neighborhood.

Choi: I strongly feel that *A Guitar in the Bucket* should have something. It's kind of unique. As Max said *A Guitar in the Bucket* is going to get other awards. That means it has a certain kind of quality. If we totally ignore it, people might think, what happened to this jury? I just feel that it should at least get a Special Mention, it's very unique.

Max: I agree.

Fan: First of all, do we agree that *A Guitar in the Bucket* is not Silver because there are two votes from Haze (Tsui) and Joycelyn (Choi). If we are going to decide between *A Guitar in the bucket* and *My Dear Son*, then this is the topic that we have to discuss, not double Special Mention.

- Lo: Yamamura-san, what do you think if *My Dear Son* gets Silver?
- Koji: It's okay for me, and *A Guitar in the Bucket* for Special Mention.
- Choi: I can live with *MUI* taking Silver, if *A Guitar in the bucket* can have Special Mention. If *My Dear Son* gets special mention, it should get the MacBook because it's the highest scoring Hong Kong animator.
- Tsui: If you really think *My Dear Son* is better than *MUI* you can fight for it.
- Lo: Sometimes it's hard to compare. For my personal interests, I like *My Dear Son* the best, and I'd like to defend Hong Kong.
- Choi: Are we all happy *MUI* getting the Silver, *My Dear Son* getting Special Mention?
- Lo: That's fine for me.
- Fan: Is it *MUI* getting Silver or *A Guitar in the Bucket*?
- Choi: I guess the jurors agree that *MUI* gets the Silver.
- Fan: But there are two Silver votes for *A Guitar in the Bucket*, and only one Silver vote for *MUI*.
- Lo: My Silver is *MUI*, and *My Dear Son* is Special Mention.
- Choi: *A Guitar in the Bucket* is well-made and is my personal favourite. However, I am ready to respect Lo and others' opinion that it is not as unique as the other work.
- Fan: I would like to know, is there anyone who oppose *My Dear Son* getting any awards? Because there are three jurors who never chose *My Dear Son* in your list.
- Max: It's a compromise I can live with.
- Choi: I agree. I will go for *MUI* for Silver, and *My Dear Son* and *A Guitar in the Bucket* for Special Mention.
- Fan: Haze (Tsui), what do you think? Because you chose *A Guitar in the Bucket* for Silver.



Tsui: I give up. I tried.

Choi: This is the point of elaboration. We communicate and then we come to a consensus.

Fan: I should ask Lo Sir whether you like *A Guitar in the Bucket* because you didn't pick it.

Lo: It's not my cup of tea. It was never in my list.

Koji: I'm happy to go with *MUI* getting Silver.

Fan: That means *MUI* will get the Silver award. We go to Special Mention. The first Special Mention nominate will be *A Guitar in the Bucket*, the second nomination is *My Dear Son*. Are you all good with this result?

(The jurors agreed)

Choi: The point of discussion is what do we want to encourage? Now, you have a very diverse winning list. *Patient's Mind* is very fresh, *MUI* is very local with Cantonese slang and things like that. And then you have *My Dear Son* which is well-made but more traditional. And *A Guitar in the Bucket* is also a more traditional animation, but with a message. So you have all the themes we like.

## 28<sup>th</sup> ifva Animation Category Award Winners

### Gold Award

*Patient's Mind*

Wang Zhiheng (China)

### Silver Award

*MUI*

Wong Weng-chon (Macao)

### Special Mention

*My Dear Son*

Lilian Fu (Hong Kong)

*A Guitar in the Bucket*

Kim Bo-young (South Korea)